

Analysis of Autogate Policy Implementation at the Immigration Inspection Place of I Gusti Ngurah Rai International Airport Bali

Yuditya Eka Mandala Putra

Master of Public Administration Student, Mahendradatta University

Corresponding Author: Yuditya Eka Mandala Putra yudityaputra90@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Autogate, Immigration, Efficiency, Service Quality

Received : 28, December

Revised : 18, January

Accepted: 24, February

©2025 Putra: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

The rapid growth of the tourism sector in Bali has increased the volume of passengers at I Gusti Ngurah Rai International Airport and put pressure on immigration services. As a solution, the Indonesian government has implemented a policy of using Autogate to speed up the inspection process and improve the quality of service. This study aims to analyze the implementation of the Autogate policy at Ngurah Rai Airport, identify factors that influence its success, and provide recommendations for improvement. This study uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive method. Data were collected through in-depth interviews with immigration officers, service users, and direct observations in the field. The results of the study indicate that the implementation of Autogate has succeeded in increasing efficiency and user satisfaction. However, there are still several challenges such as lack of socialization, technical errors, and user behavior that need to be addressed. This study concludes that the implementation of Autogate is the right step to improve the quality of immigration services at Ngurah Rai Airport. However, there needs to be ongoing efforts to improve socialization, improve the system, and change user behavior so that the benefits of this technology can be optimal.

INTRODUCTION

Education is a very important activity for preparing children to face their future lives. Education is the process of developing individual skills in attitudes and behavior in society. A social process in which a person is influenced by an organized environment, such as a home or school, so that they can achieve self-development and social skills.

Equal access to education is one of the problems faced by the world of Indonesian education. There are still gaps in several regions in Indonesia in obtaining proper access to education. Several underdeveloped regions in Indonesia have not received good educational facilities. One of the efforts to overcome this problem is the Indonesian Government issuing a zoning policy which is regulated in Permendikbud No. 44 of 2019 concerning the Admission of New Students in Kindergartens, Elementary Schools, Middle Schools, High Schools, and Vocational Schools. The implementation of the zoning policy has been implemented in several local governments in Indonesia, one of which is the Bali Provincial Government which has implemented a zoning policy in several districts and cities.

The zoning system is a system for regulating the process of accepting new students according to their area of residence. This system is regulated in Permendikbud Number 14 of 2018 and is intended so that there are no schools that are considered favorite and non-favorite schools. SMA Negeri 11 was established in 2021, where in that year the zoning system was established. As a new school, SMAN 11 Denpasar faces unique challenges, such as building a reputation, improving the quality of learning, and attracting students in its zone area. On the other hand, the zoning system also brings opportunities for this school to accept students with more diverse backgrounds, so that it can create an inclusive learning environment. This research is important to do because it can provide an overview of the impact of the zoning system on new schools, especially in urban areas such as Denpasar. The results of this study are expected to be a reference for the government, schools, and education stakeholders in optimizing the zoning system policy, especially for newly established schools.

In conclusion, this study provides valuable insights into the implementation of the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar, highlighting both its successes and challenges. The findings reveal that while the policy has contributed to a more equitable distribution of students, certain obstacles, such as public perception and technical issues, still hinder its effectiveness. By analyzing the factors that support and impede the system, this research offers a comprehensive evaluation that can serve as a reference for policymakers, schools, and the community. Theoretically, it enriches the understanding of zoning policies in Indonesia's education system, while practically, it provides guidance for improvements at both the governmental and institutional levels. Through continuous evaluation and necessary adjustments, the zoning system can be refined to ensure a more inclusive and accessible education for all students. This research ultimately emphasizes the importance of collaboration

between stakeholders to optimize policy implementation and enhance the overall quality of education in Indonesia.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Education System

Indonesia's founding fathers recognized the strategic role of education, as seen in Article 31 of the 1945 Constitution (UUD). This was due to Indonesia's long colonial period, in contrast to Europe's modernization during the Renaissance (Soedijarto, 2007).

Law No. 20 of 2003 on the National Education System (UU SISDIKNAS) defines education as an interconnected system aimed at achieving national goals (Soetarno, 2003). Key components include the environment, facilities, resources, and the community, all working together. The system is centralized, with regulations covering curriculum, teaching methods, and assessments nationwide. National education aims to develop students who are religious, ethical, knowledgeable, creative, independent, and responsible citizens.

Public Policy

Public policy refers to government decisions on actions or inactions (Dye, 2002). Anderson (in Hill & Hupe, 2002) defines it as a series of actions addressing problems, while Friedrich views it as goal-oriented decisions.

Policies operate at three levels (Abidin, 2006):

- a) General Policy - Broad guidelines (e.g., laws, government regulations).
- b) Implementation Policy - Detailed directives from ministries or regional governments.
- c) Technical Policy - Operational instructions (e.g., circulars).

New Student Admissions Zoning System (PPDB)

The PPDB zoning policy, introduced in 2017 under President Joko Widodo, aims to eliminate favoritism among schools and ensure students attend schools near their homes (Mahpudin, 2020).

Key regulations:

- a) Schools must accept at least 90% of students from the nearest zone (Permendikbud No. 17/2017).
- b) 5% of seats are for students applying based on achievements outside the zone (Permendikbud No. 14/2018).
- c) The goal is equitable education quality and access (Haryanti, 2020).

Factors Influencing Zoning Policy Implementation

According to Edward III (1980), four factors impact policy success:

- a) Communication - Clear and consistent messaging.
- b) Resources - Adequate staffing, information, and facilities.
- c) Disposition - Commitment and honesty from implementers.
- d) Bureaucratic Structure - Effective coordination and clear procedures.
- e) Imron (2008) adds other challenges: policy complexity, unclear formulation, limited resources, implementer expertise, public support, and bureaucratic efficiency.

Public Policy Evaluation

Policy evaluation assesses effectiveness based on goal achievement (Dunn, 2003). It provides feedback on implementation and ensures policies address issues efficiently (Trochim, 2009). Evaluations are crucial for refining policy mechanisms and decision-making.

Table 1. Policy Evaluation Criteria

Tipe Kriteria	Pertanyaan	Ilustrasi
Efektivitas	Apakah hasil yang diinginkan telah tercapai?	Unit pelayanan
Efisiensi	Seberapa banyak usaha yang diperlukan untuk mencapai hasil yang diinginkan	Unit biaya, manfaat bersih, rasio cost-benefit
Kecukupan	Seberapa jauh pencapaian hasil yang diinginkan memecahkan masalah	Biaya tetap, efektivitas tetap
Perataan	Apakah biaya manfaat didistribusikan dengan merata kepada kelompok-kelompok yang berbeda	Kriteria Pareto, Kriteria Kaldor-Hicks, kriteria Rawls
Responsivitas	Apakah hasil kebijakan memuaskan kebutuhan, preferensi, atau nilai kelompok-kelompok tertentu	Konsisten dengan survey warga negara
Ketepatan	Apakah hasil atau tujuan yang diinginkan benar-benar berguna atau bernilai	Program publik harus merata dan efisien

METHODOLOGY

This study adopts a qualitative research approach, as described by Kirk & Miller, which emphasizes observing people in their natural environment and using their own language. The qualitative method is chosen to explore the implementation of the zoning system policy in high schools by collecting data from both field observations and relevant literature. This approach enables a holistic and contextual understanding of the policy's impact at SMAN 11 Denpasar.

The study utilizes both primary and secondary data. Primary data is gathered through direct observations and open-ended interviews with the principal, teachers, administrative staff, and students to understand their experiences with the zoning system. Meanwhile, secondary data is obtained from various written sources such as books, articles, reports, and official documents to support and validate the findings.

The data collection techniques include observation, interviews, and documentation study. Observations allow researchers to witness firsthand how the zoning system is applied in the school. Interviews provide in-depth insights from key stakeholders, helping to clarify and expand on the findings.

Additionally, a documentation study is conducted to collect supporting information from written records and reports related to the zoning policy.

The collected data is analyzed using the Miles & Huberman (1992) model, which consists of three steps: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. Data reduction involves selecting and organizing key information while eliminating irrelevant details. The processed data is then presented in an organized manner, such as through tables or summaries, to identify patterns and relationships. Finally, conclusions are drawn by interpreting the findings and verifying them through comparisons with existing literature and further reflections.

By following this methodology, the study aims to provide a clear and comprehensive analysis of the zoning system's implementation in high schools, particularly at SMAN 11 Denpasar.

RESEARCH RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The Autogate operational system at Ngurah Rai Airport has been designed to provide a fast and efficient inspection experience for passengers. The process begins with online registration via <https://evisa.imigrasi.go.id>. After that, passengers only need to scan their passports on the Autogate device. The system will automatically verify the passenger's identity and open the gate.

One of the main obstacles that emerged in interviews with immigration officers was the lack of adequate training. One officer said, 'We were given training, but I think it was not in-depth enough, especially to overcome technical problems that often occur. This shows that the lack of technical competence of officers is one of the factors that hampers Autogate's performance.

The integration of the e-visa system with Autogate has provided significant convenience for foreign passengers visiting Indonesia. By scanning an electronic passport that has been connected to e-visa data, passengers can automatically pass through immigration checks in seconds. This not only reduces significant waiting times, but also increases passenger comfort and satisfaction. In addition, the use of biometric technology in Autogate also increases the security of checks, because the system can accurately verify the identity of passengers and prevent misuse of documents. Activities that can be carried out by foreign e-visa holders, especially eVOA, in Indonesia include:

1. Travel;
2. Government Duties;
3. Business Discussions;
4. Purchase of Goods;
5. Meetings; and
6. Transit

The Autogate facility that has been implemented at I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport, aims to speed up the immigration inspection process and improve comfort for passengers. However, not all passengers can immediately use this facility. There are special requirements, especially for foreign nationals (WNA), in order to be able to use Autogate, namely: electronic

passport holders, citizens of visa-free countries, electronic visa holders, limited stay permit holders, and permanent stay permit holders. The procedure for applying for an e-visa / e-VOA is as follows:

- a) Make sure the foreigner's passport type is an electronic passport;
- b) Open the page <https://evisa.imigration.go.id/>;
- c) Select the Visa menu according to the visa subject and the passenger's purpose of entering Indonesia;
- d) Make payments according to PNBPN;
- e) Passengers can download the visas they have applied for.

After passing through the Autogate, passengers will receive an email confirmation that includes the following information:

- a) Information on the Immigration Checkpoints passed;
- b) Data on when passengers boarded; and
- c) Validity period of residence permit.

To find out the implementation of the Autogate policy at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport, the researcher has conducted interviews related to the planning of the Autogate program with several sources consisting of the Head of the Examination Section IV of the Class I Special Immigration Office TPI Ngurah Rai, the Supervisor of the Examination Section IV, and the Assistant Supervisor of the Examination Section IV. In the interview, the researcher has also adjusted it to the theory used in this study, namely the following theory by Farida Yusuf Tayibnapis, which consists of:

a) *Program Planning*

The purpose of program planning is to analyze how to plan the immigration inspection process through the Autogate system at the Immigration Inspection Site of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport, and to analyze the inputs received so that in future implementation it can be in accordance with the standards that have been set.

Based on an interview excerpt with Mr. Muhamad Irfan Al Fikri as Head of Section IV of the Immigration Examination Place Division of the Class I Special Immigration Office TPI Ngurah Rai regarding the Autogate policy is as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Muhammad Irfan Al Fikri (Kepala Seksi Pemeriksaan IV)		Detail
Waktu		Senin, 04 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Apa latar belakang diterapkannya sistem <i>Autogate</i> di Tempat Pemeriksaan Imigrasi (TPI) Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai?	Sistem <i>Autogate</i> diterapkan untuk meningkatkan efisiensi dan kecepatan proses pemeriksaan keimigrasian, mengurangi antrean panjang di bandara, serta memanfaatkan teknologi untuk mendukung pelayanan berbasis digital sesuai dengan amanat Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2009.
2	Bagaimana sistem <i>Autogate</i> dirancang untuk mendukung standar pelayanan publik?	<i>Autogate</i> dirancang untuk memenuhi indikator standar pelayanan publik, seperti transparansi, akurasi, kecepatan, dan kenyamanan pengguna layanan. Teknologi ini juga mencakup aksesibilitas bagi kelompok rentan, seperti lansia atau penyandang disabilitas.
3	Apakah ada analisis kebutuhan pengguna (penumpang) sebelum implementasi <i>Autogate</i> ?	Sebelum implementasi, dilakukan survei terhadap penumpang terkait waktu layanan yang diharapkan dan fitur apa yang mereka anggap penting. Studi banding juga dilakukan ke negara-negara yang sudah menerapkan sistem serupa.
4	Bagaimana keterlibatan stakeholder dalam perencanaan sistem <i>Autogate</i> ?	Stakeholder utama, seperti Direktorat Jenderal Imigrasi, operator bandara, dan penyedia teknologi, bekerja sama dalam mendesain dan mengimplementasikan <i>Autogate</i> untuk memastikan kelancaran integrasi sistem dan infrastruktur.

Picture 1. Reseraceher interview

Based on the results of the interview with Mr. Muhammad Irfan Al Fikri, Head of Inspection Section IV, it can be concluded that the planning for the implementation of the *Autogate* system at the Immigration Inspection Point (TPI) of I Gusti Ngurah Rai International Airport is based on five main reasons: (1) increasing efficiency and productivity by speeding up the inspection process and reducing queues; (2) improving the quality of public services through transparency, accuracy, speed, and passenger comfort; (3) supporting digital transformation in accordance with the mandate of Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services; (4) meeting user expectations through comprehensive needs analysis; and (5) encouraging collaboration between stakeholders, including the Directorate General of Immigration, airport operators, and technology providers.

The researcher also conducted an interview with Mr. Ida Bagus Yogi as the Supervisor of Section IV Examination in the Immigration Examination Place Division of the Class I Special TPI Ngurah Rai Immigration Office with several excerpts from the interview including.

Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Ida Bagus Yogi (Penyelia Seksi Pemeriksaan IV)		Detail
Waktu		Selasa, 05 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Apa saja persiapan teknis yang dilakukan sebelum penerapan <i>Autogate</i> ?	Persiapan meliputi pemasangan perangkat keras <i>Autogate</i> , integrasi sistem dengan database keimigrasian, dan pelatihan bagi petugas untuk menangani pengguna dan pemeliharaan teknis dasar.
2	Bagaimana kebijakan <i>Autogate</i> memperhitungkan kebutuhan penumpang berkebutuhan khusus atau rentan?	Sebelumnya kami telah mempertimbangkan itu, namun saat ini <i>Autogate</i> belum dapat menjangkau penumpang penyandang disabilitas (khususnya pengguna kursi roda). Namun <i>Autogate</i> dapat digunakan penumpang kategori lansia.

Picture 2. Researcher interview

Based on an interview with Mr. Ida Bagus Yogi as the supervisor of Section IV Inspection of the Class I Special TPI Immigration Office of Ngurah Rai, it can be concluded that the implementation of the *Autogate* system at I Gusti Ngurah Rai International Airport was carried out through thorough technical preparation, including hardware installation, system integration, and officer training. This system aims to increase the efficiency of the immigration inspection process by reducing passenger waiting time. However, limited accessibility for passengers with special needs, such as wheelchair users, is still a challenge. Nevertheless, the *Autogate* system has great potential to be further developed to accommodate all users and improve service quality.

This was also added by Mr. I Komang Adika Pranata and Mr. Bernard Budayanto as the Assistant Supervisor of the Inspection Section IV in the Immigration Inspection Area Division of the Class I Immigration Office, especially TPI Ngurah Rai. The interview excerpt is as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Asisten Penyelia		Detail
Nama		1. Bapak I Komang Adika Pranata 2. Bapak Bernard Budayanto
Waktu		Selasa, 05 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
Pertanyaan	Jawaban	
Apa masukan dari petugas koster yang dipertimbangkan dalam perencanaan <i>Autogate</i> ?	Perlu adanya petunjuk yang lebih jelas dan mudah dipahami, baik dalam bentuk tulisan maupun visual, di setiap tahap penggunaan <i>Autogate</i> . (Jawaban Bapak I Komang Adika Pranata)	
	Petugas koster meminta sistem yang lebih intuitif, mudah dipahami oleh penumpang internasional, serta meminimalkan gangguan teknis seperti kesalahan pembacaan paspor. (Jawaban Bapak Bernard Budayanto)	

Picture 3. Researcher interview

Based on the results of interviews with Mr. I Komang Adika Pranata and Mr. Bernard Budayanto as Assistant Supervisor of Inspection Section IV of the

Special Class I Immigration Office of TPI Ngurah Rai, it can be concluded that the counter officers emphasized three important aspects in optimizing the Autogate system. First, the need for clear and easy-to-understand instructions for use, both in writing and visually, to help international passengers who are not fluent in Indonesian. Second, the Autogate system should be designed to be more intuitive so that it is easy to use without the assistance of officers. Third, the system must be able to minimize technical problems, such as errors in reading passports, to increase efficiency and user comfort.

Based on the overall results of the interviews above regarding the planning and implementation of programs in the Autogate system, it can be concluded that in the planning of the Autogate system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport, there are several important points summarized from interviews with various parties. The implementation of Autogate at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has been planned by considering aspects of efficiency, technology, and public service. However, there are challenges related to the inclusivity and needs of passengers with special needs. Input from counter officers and stakeholders indicates the need for further improvements to improve ease of use and minimize technical obstacles, so that the Autogate system can be more optimal and inclusive.

b) Program Implementation

The purpose of implementing the program is to analyze whether the immigration inspection process through the Autogate system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has been running in accordance with the program planning, especially in terms of the working procedures of the Autogate system at the TPI, whether or not it is in accordance with the public service standards regulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Empowerment of State Civil Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform Number 15 of 2014, and the role and responsibilities of immigration officers in supporting the implementation of the Autogate system.

In implementing this program, the researcher has conducted interviews with various sources, namely the Head of Section IV Examination, Supervisor of Section IV Examination, Assistant Supervisor of Section IV Examination, immigration counter officers, and passengers.

Based on an interview excerpt from Mr. Muhamad Irfan Al Fikri as Head of Section IV of the Immigration Inspection Area of the Class I Special Immigration Office TPI Ngurah Rai, is as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Muhamad Irfan Al Fikri (Kepala Seksi Pemeriksaan IV)		Detail
Waktu		Senin, 04 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Bagaimana prosedur kerja sistem <i>Autogate</i> di TPI?	Pesumpang memindai paspor di mesin <i>Autogate</i> , dilanjutkan dengan pengambilan data foto biometrik. Sistem secara otomatis memverifikasi data dengan database imigrasi. Jika sesuai, pintu gerbang terbuka tanpa intervensi petugas.
2	Apakah sistem <i>Autogate</i> telah berjalan sesuai dengan standar pelayanan publik yang diatur dalam Permenpan RB No. 15 Tahun 2014?	<i>Autogate</i> telah disesuaikan dengan prinsip transparansi, efisiensi, dan akuntabilitas. Namun, evaluasi rutin diperlukan untuk memastikan kualitas layanan tetap terjaga.
3	Bagaimana peran dan tanggung jawab petugas dalam mendukung pelaksanaan sistem <i>Autogate</i> ?	Petugas bertugas memberikan pendampingan kepada pengguna yang mengalami kesulitan teknis, memantau kelancaran sistem, dan menangani penumpang yang memerlukan pemeriksaan manual.

Picture 4. Researcher interview

Based on the interview results above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the *Autogate* system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport is designed to improve the efficiency of immigration services through automated procedures. This system allows passengers to conduct immigration checks independently by utilizing passport scanning and biometric data retrieval which is automatically verified by the immigration database.

Autogate has fulfilled the principles of transparency, efficiency, and accountability as regulated in Permenpan RB No. 15 of 2014. However, routine evaluation is needed to maintain and improve service standards. Although most of the processes are automated, officers still play an important role in providing technical assistance, monitoring the smoothness of the system, and handling manual checks when necessary.

The *Autogate* system provides convenience for immigration service users, but its relevance and effectiveness require continuous evaluation to ensure optimal service according to public service standards.

This was added by Mr. Ida Bagus Yogi as the Supervisor of Section IV Examination in the Immigration Examination Place Division of the Class I Special TPI Ngurah Rai Immigration Office, the following is an excerpt from the interview with the person concerned:

Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Ida Bagus Yogi (Penyelia Seksi Pemeriksaan IV)		Detail
Waktu		Selasa, 05 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Bagaimana petugas memastikan bahwa sistem <i>Autogate</i> berfungsi optimal setiap hari?	Pemeliharaan harian dilakukan untuk memeriksa kondisi perangkat keras dan konektivitas sistem. Laporan teknis disampaikan setiap hari kepada bagian terkait.
2	Apa langkah-langkah yang diambil jika terjadi kendala teknis pada <i>Autogate</i> ?	Jika terjadi gangguan teknis, petugas segera mengalihkan penumpang ke jalur manual. Tim IT dipanggil untuk memperbaiki sistem secara cepat.
3	Bagaimana koordinasi antara petugas dan penyelia dalam pelaksanaan sistem <i>Autogate</i> ?	Penyelia memantau pelaksanaan operasional, memberikan arahan jika terjadi masalah, dan memastikan petugas bekerja sesuai standar.

Picture 5. Researcher interview

Based on the interview results above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the *Autogate* system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport was carried out in a planned and systematic manner. The main steps include daily maintenance to ensure that hardware and connectivity remain optimal, quick handling of technical constraints by diverting passengers to manual lanes and involving the IT team, and good coordination between officers and supervisors to ensure that operations run according to procedures. This approach is key to maintaining the smooth running of the system and the quality of public services.

This was also added by Mr. I Komang Adika Pranata and Mr. Bernard Budayanto as Assistant Supervisor of Inspection Section IV in the Immigration Inspection Area Division of Class I Immigration Office, especially TPI Ngurah Rai. The interview excerpt with the person concerned is as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Asisten Penyelia (Bapak Bernard Budayanto dan Bapak I Komang Adika Pranata)		Detail
Waktu		Selasa, 05 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Bagaimana tanggung jawab Anda dalam memastikan sistem <i>Autogate</i> berjalan lancar? (Pertanyaan untuk Bapak I Komang Adika Pranata)	Memastikan setiap unit <i>Autogate</i> berfungsi dengan baik, melaporkan kendala kepada penyelia, dan memberikan arahan kepada petugas di konter.
2	Apa saja kendala teknis yang sering terjadi, dan bagaimana cara mengatasinya? (Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Bernard Budayanto)	Kendala umum meliputi kegagalan membaca paspor elektronik dan masalah konektivitas. Solusi sementara adalah menggunakan jalur manual sambil menunggu perbaikan.

Picture 6. Researcher interview

Based on the interviews above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Autogate system places responsibility and technical constraint solutions as the main focus of the Assistant Supervisor. The role of the Assistant Supervisor includes ensuring the optimal function of each Autogate unit through daily operational monitoring, reporting technical constraints to the supervisor for follow-up, and providing direction to counter staff for smooth service. Common technical constraints, such as failure to read electronic passports and connectivity problems, are resolved with temporary solutions, namely directing passengers to the manual lane until repairs are made. With this strategic role, the Assistant Supervisor becomes the main liaison in maintaining smooth Autogate operations and ensuring optimal service despite technical constraints.

Based on interviews with Briyantama Kusumanegara and Danu Dwi Pamungkas, as immigration counter officers of Inspection Section IV in the Immigration Inspection Area of the Class I Special Immigration Office TPI Ngurah Rai are as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Petugas Kantor Pemeriksaan Keimigrasian		Detail	
Waktu		Sabtu, 11 November 2024	
Tempat		Rencana Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali	
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban Briyantama Kusumanegara	Jawaban Danu Dwi Pamungkas
1	Seberapa permasalahan Banyak dalam memeriksakan Autogate sehari-hari?	Selama pemeriksaan, autogate memang membantu mempercepat proses pemeriksaan. Namun, terkadang sistem agak sensitif terhadap kualitas paspor, terutama yang sudah agak tua. Beberapa kali saya harus membantu penumpang untuk memperbaiki paspor dengan benar agar bisa terbaca dengan baik.	Autogate memang memudahkan pekerjaan, tapi saya sesekali harus menjelaskan kepada penumpang tentang cara penggunaannya yang benar. Banyak penumpang yang masih bingung, terutama yang baru pertama kali menggunakannya.
2	Apakah masalah yang sering ditemui dalam pemeriksaan Autogate?	Selain masalah kualitas paspor, seringkali terjadi gangguan koneksi internet yang menyebabkan sistem menjadi lambat atau bahkan tidak bertugas. Hal ini sangat mengganggu, terutama saat jam sibuk.	Selain masalah teknis, seringkali ada penumpang yang membawa barang baruan yang sudah banyak dan sulit untuk dibedakan di tempat yang didominasi oleh proses pemeriksaan biometrik wajah menjadi terganggu dan pemeriksaan menjadi lebih lama.
3	Apakah ada yang pernah bertanya dan karena banyak dari sistem Autogate memang Banyak?	Tidak sedikit yang pernah bertanya dalam menggunakan pemeriksaan dengan cepat dan akurat. Namun, saya merasa sistem informasi untuk penumpang masih kurang jelas, terutama untuk penumpang asing yang tidak terlalu familiar dengan konsep pemeriksaan berbasis teknologi dan bahasa Inggris.	Tidak jarang penumpang sudah bertanya jika ada penumpang yang kurang dalam bahasa, baik itu maka berlaku paspor yang kurang dari 6 bulan. Namun, saya merasa sistem bahasa untuk dalam hal profiling sistem pemeriksaan. Kami sering memberikan penjelasan dengan tujuan untuk menjaga agar masalah yang lebih baik ke depannya dapat diminimalkan melalui Autogate.

Picture 7. Researcher interview

Based on the interview above, it can be concluded that the Autogate System at I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has made a significant contribution to speeding up the immigration inspection process and reducing the workload of officers. However, several challenges are still faced, such as technical problems related to internet connection, system sensitivity to passport quality, and lack of understanding of new passengers on how to use Autogate.

Features that are considered useful include facial verification and notifications regarding passengers with blocked status or passports that are about to expire. On the other hand, information for non-Indonesian and English language passengers and an ineffective profiling system are still weaknesses.

To improve efficiency and effectiveness, it is necessary to make improvements to technical stability, information clarity, and system intelligence in detecting anomalies. With these steps, Autogate is expected to be able to provide a more optimal experience for users and immigration officers.

Researchers also conducted program implementation interviews on the Autogate system for 2 (two) foreign national passengers. Excerpts from interviews that have been conducted are as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Penumpang		Detail	
Waktu		Selasa, 12 November 2024	
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali	
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban Mrs. Smith Patricia Ann (Warga Negara Amerika Serikat)	Jawaban Mrs. Shik Devanshi Bankim (Warga Negara India)
1	Bagaimana pengalaman Ibu menggunakan <i>Autogate</i> di Bandara Ngurah Rai?	Pengalaman saya menggunakan <i>Autogate</i> sangat positif! Prosesnya sangat cepat dan mudah. Saya hanya perlu memindai paspor dan melihat ke kamera. Tidak perlu lagi antri lama seperti dulu.	Saya merasa sedikit bingung pada awalnya karena ini adalah pertama kalinya saya menggunakan <i>Autogate</i> . Tapi setelah dibantu oleh petugas, saya bisa memahaminya. Prosesnya memang lebih cepat daripada pemeriksaan manual.
2	Apakah Ibu merasa proses pemeriksaan keimigrasian menjadi lebih cepat dan mudah dengan <i>Autogate</i> ?	Tentu saja! Waktu tunggu saya berkurang drastis. Ini sangat membantu, terutama setelah penerbangan yang panjang.	Ya, prosesnya menjadi lebih cepat, tapi saya masih lebih suka diperiksa langsung oleh petugas. Saya merasa lebih aman jika ada interaksi langsung dengan petugas imigrasi.
3	Fitur apa yang Ibu sukai dan tidak sukai dari sistem <i>Autogate</i> ?	Saya sukai sekali dengan fitur animasinya. Namun, saya merasa perlu ada petunjuk suara untuk pengguna asing. Karena kami telah melalui perjalanan yang panjang dan akan sangat melelahkan jika harus membaca lagi petunjuk penggunaannya.	Saya sukai dengan tampilan layarnya yang modern. Namun, saya merasa tempat untuk meletakkan barang bawaan agak sempit. Kadang sulit untuk mengatur posisi barang saat berada di dalam <i>Autogate</i> sehingga saya sempat mengulang dari awal.

Picture 8. Researcher interview

Based on the interview above, it can be concluded that the Autogate System at I Gusti Ngurah Rai International Airport provides a positive experience for users by increasing the efficiency of immigration checks and ease of use. The advantages of this system include a faster process compared to manual checks, a modern screen display, and ease of operation, especially for users who are familiar with technology.

However, there are several aspects that need improvement, namely the provision of voice guidance in various languages to assist foreign passengers, adjustments to the design of the luggage compartment to make it more spacious and practical, and the existence of human interaction as an additional option to provide a sense of security for some passengers.

Overall, the Autogate system contributes significantly to improving public services at the airport. To achieve optimal user satisfaction, improvements are needed in the aspects of information, physical design, and service flexibility.

Based on the overall results of the program planning interviews, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Autogate policy at Ngurah Rai Airport has increased the efficiency and effectiveness of immigration checks.

The Autogate system has contributed significantly to improving the quality of public services in the field of immigration. However, several aspects need to be improved to achieve optimal results. Continuous evaluation is needed so that this technology can become a model for public services in other sectors.

c) *Program Evaluation*

The purpose of program evaluation in this study is to analyze the extent to which the program has succeeded in achieving the goals that have been set. By covering several aspects that are in accordance with the theory used by the researcher, such as implementation effectiveness, program efficiency, compliance with policies, long-term impacts, and recommendations for improvement.

In the program evaluation, researchers have conducted interviews with various sources, namely the Head of Section IV Examination, Supervisor of Section IV Examination, Assistant Supervisor of Section IV Examination, immigration counter officers, and passengers. Based on the interview excerpt with Mr. Muhamad Irfan Al Fikri as the Head of Section IV Examination is as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Muhamad Irfan Al Fikri (Kepala Seksi Pemeriksaan IV)		Detail
Waktu		Senin, 04 November 2024
Tempat		Bunlar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Bagaimana penerapan <i>Autogate</i> ini sesuai dengan kebijakan dan standar operasional yang telah ditetapkan?	Penerapan <i>Autogate</i> sudah mengacu pada Standar Operasional Prosedur (SOP) yang ditetapkan oleh Direktorat Jenderal Imigrasi. Sistem ini mendukung kebijakan pelayanan publik berbasis teknologi dengan prinsip efisiensi, akurasi, dan kenyamanan, sesuai amanat Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2009 tentang Pelayanan Publik.
2	Bagaimana cara mengevaluasi keberhasilan penerapan <i>Autogate</i> ?	Kami melakukan evaluasi melalui survei kepuasan pengguna, analisis data operasional, dan observasi langsung petugas saat operasional <i>Autogate</i> .
3	Apa saja indikator utama yang digunakan untuk menilai kinerja sistem <i>Autogate</i> ?	Kami menilai dari waktu proses, tingkat keberhasilan sistem, jumlah keluhan, dan penggunaan sistem.
4	Bagaimana tindak lanjut dari hasil evaluasi untuk meningkatkan kualitas layanan?	Kami melakukan perbaikan sistem, pelatihan petugas, sosialisasi kepada penumpang, dan evaluasi berkala.

Picture 9. Researcher interview

Based on the interview results above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Autogate system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has complied with public service standards as regulated in Law Number 25 of 2009 and Regulation of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform No. 15 of 2014. The Autogate system also reflects compliance with aspects of efficiency, accuracy, transparency, accountability, and fairness, which are the main pillars of public service standards. This implementation has succeeded in increasing the speed, quality, and trust of users in immigration services.

Based on an interview excerpt with Mr. Ida Bagus Yogi as the Supervisor of Section IV of the Class I Special TPI Immigration Office Ngurah Rai regarding the program evaluation in the Autogate system is as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Bapak Ida Bagus Yogi (Pencelia Selai Pemeriksaan IV)		Detail
Waktu		Selama 05 November 2024
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban
1	Bagaimana Bapak memastikan bahwa pelaksanaan pemeriksaan keimigrasian melalui <i>Autogate</i> sesuai dengan standar yang ditetapkan?	Kami memastikan pelaksanaan sesuai standar melalui pengawasan harian oleh pencelia. Selain itu, kami menggunakan checklist operasional untuk memastikan semua fungsi <i>Autogate</i> berjalan dengan baik. Kami juga rutin memonitor laporan dari petugas di lapangan terkait kendala teknis maupun operasional.
2	Apakah ada rencana atau prosedur yang perlu diperbaiki untuk meningkatkan pelaksanaan <i>Autogate</i> dalam pemeriksaan keimigrasian?	Ya, ada beberapa rencana yang perlu disesuaikan, terutama terkait penempatan petugas yang tidak dapat menggunakan <i>Autogate</i> , seperti mereka yang memiliki paspor non elektronik atau memiliki kondisi fisik tertentu. Selain itu, diperlukan prosedur yang lebih terstruktur untuk mengatasi gangguan teknis secara cepat tanpa mengganggu operasional lainnya.
3	Seberapa besar tingkat pemahaman petugas imigrasi terhadap kelebihan penerapan <i>Autogate</i> ?	Secara umum, tingkat pemahaman petugas imigrasi cukup baik. Kami telah memberikan pelatihan secara berkala untuk memastikan semua petugas memahami Standar Operasional Prosedur (SOP) dan dapat mengatasi masalah yang mungkin timbul. Namun, kami akan terus melakukan evaluasi dan memberikan pelatihan tambahan jika diperlukan.
4	Apa saran Anda untuk meningkatkan performa sistem <i>Autogate</i> dalam pemeriksaan keimigrasian di masa mendatang?	Saya menyarankan beberapa hal. Pertama, perlu adanya peningkatan kapasitas server untuk menunjang jumlah pengguna yang semakin meningkat. Kedua, perlu dilakukan pemeliharaan sistem untuk dapat mengintegrasikan dengan sistem informasi lainnya, khususnya dengan Sistem Informasi Profile Penumpang. Ketiga, kami perlu melakukan sosialisasi yang lebih intensif kepada penumpang mengenai manfaat dan cara penggunaan <i>Autogate</i> .

Picture 10. Researcher interview

Based on the interview above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Autogate system at Ngurah Rai Airport has contributed significantly to improving the quality of public services in the field of immigration, in accordance with Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services.

Based on the interview excerpt with Mr. Bernard Budayanto and Mr. I Komang Adika Pranata as Assistant Supervisor of Section IV of the Class I Special Immigration Office TPI Ngurah Rai, the following:

No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban Bapak Bernard Budayanto	Jawaban Bapak I Komang Adika Pranata
1	Apa mekanisme untuk mengukur kepuasan pengguna <i>Autogate</i> ?	Kami mengukur kepuasan pengguna melalui survei langsung yang dilakukan di area kedatangan dan keberangkatan. Penumpang diminta untuk memberikan penilaian melalui Indeks Kepuasan Masyarakat tentang kemudahan, kecepatan, dan kualitas layanan <i>Autogate</i> . Selain itu, kami juga menganalisis data dari laporan keluhan yang diterima oleh petugas di lapangan.	Salah satu mekanisme yang kami gunakan adalah dengan menyediakan perangkat survei elektronik berupa Indeks Kepuasan Masyarakat di dekat <i>Autogate</i> , sehingga penumpang bisa memberikan tanggapan segera setelah menggunakan sistem. Kami juga mengumpulkan feedback melalui media sosial dan website resmi bandara.
2	Apakah ada pelatihan rutin untuk meningkatkan keterampilan petugas dalam menangani <i>Autogate</i> ?	Ya, pelatihan rutin diadakan setiap tiga bulan sekali. Pelatihan mencakup pemahaman teknis sistem <i>Autogate</i> , troubleshooting dasar, dan cara menangani penumpang dengan kebutuhan khusus. Selain itu, simulasi situasi darurat juga menjadi bagian dari pelatihan ini.	Ada pelatihan berkala yang dirancang khusus untuk meningkatkan keterampilan petugas. Pelatihan ini meliputi cara memberikan pendampingan kepada pengguna yang mengalami kesulitan, serta teknik komunikasi efektif untuk memastikan informasi disampaikan dengan jelas kepada penumpang.

Picture 11. Researcher interview

The Class I Special Immigration Office TPI Ngurah Rai has shown significant efforts in measuring user satisfaction and improving the quality of Autogate system services. The Autogate system has provided responsive, inclusive, and sustainable services, with room for further improvement.

Based on the interview excerpt with Briyantama Kusumanegara and Danu Dwi Pamungkas as immigration counter officers at the Examination Section IV of the Class I Special Immigration Office, TPI Ngurah Rai, the following:

Pertanyaan untuk Briyantama Kusumanegara dan Danu Dwi Pamungkas (Petugas Kounter Pemeriksaan Keimigrasian)		Detail	
Waktu		Senin, 11 November 2024	
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali	
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban Briyantama Kusumanegara	Jawaban Danu Dwi Pamungkas
1	Apakah ada perubahan yang signifikan dalam pelayanan keimigrasian setelah implementasi <i>Autogate</i> ?	Ya, perubahan sangat terasa, terutama dalam efisiensi waktu. Proses pemeriksaan menjadi lebih cepat dan mengurangi beban kerja petugas di kounter manual.	Penumpang antusias dengan <i>Autogate</i> karena pemeriksaan lebih cepat. Namun, untuk penumpang lansia atau yang kurang familiar dengan teknologi masih membutuhkan bantuan.
2	Bagaimana tanggapan penumpang terhadap penggunaan <i>Autogate</i> ?	Sebagian besar penumpang memberikan tanggapan positif karena prosesnya cepat dan mudah. Namun, beberapa penumpang lansia atau pengguna baru merasa bingung dan perlu bantuan.	Tanggapan beragam. Penumpang muda atau yang terbiasa dengan teknologi puas, tetapi penumpang asing sering kesulitan memahami instruksi sistem.
3	Fitur apa yang paling berguna dan kurang berguna dari sistem <i>Autogate</i> ?	Paling Berguna: Verifikasi biometrik wajah sangat efisien untuk memastikan identitas penumpang secara akurat. Kurang Berguna: Sistem informasi untuk penumpang, karena petunjuk visual tidak cukup membantu pengguna tertentu.	Paling Berguna: Notifikasi otomatis terkait status cekal atau masa berlaku paspor mempercepat proses pemeriksaan. Kurang Berguna: Area untuk barang bawaan terlalu sempit, menyulitkan penumpang dengan banyak barang.

Picture 12. Researcher interview

Based on the interview results above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Autogate system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has had a significant impact on improving the quality of public services in the field of immigration, especially from the perspective of counter officers.

Based on interview excerpts with Autogate user passengers, Mrs. Smith Patricia Ann (US Citizen) and Mrs. Shah Devanshi Bankim (Indian Citizen), are as follows:

Pertanyaan untuk Penumpang		Detail	
Waktu		Selasa, 12 November 2024	
Tempat		Bandar Udara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali	
No	Pertanyaan	Jawaban Mrs. Smith Patricia Ann	Jawaban Mrs. Shah Devanshi Bankim
1	Apakah dengan sistem <i>Autogate</i> ini, Ibu merasa mendapatkan pelayanan yang baik dan profesional dalam pemeriksaan keimigrasian?	Ya, saya sangat puas dengan pelayanan yang diberikan melalui sistem <i>Autogate</i> . Prosesnya sangat cepat dan efisien. Teknologinya modern dan membuat pengalaman perjalanan saya lebih nyaman.	Pelayanannya cukup baik, terutama karena waktu tunggu yang lebih singkat dibandingkan jalur manual. Namun, sistem sedikit rumit untuk pengguna pertama kali. Petugas sangat ramah dalam membantu saya sehingga ini menjadi pengalaman yang menyenangkan.
2	Apakah Ibu memiliki saran untuk meningkatkan kualitas pelayanan <i>Autogate</i> imigrasi di Bandara Ngurah Rai?	Akan lebih baik jika ada petunjuk suara multibahasa untuk mendukung penggunaan <i>Autogate</i> , terutama bagi penumpang asing yang tidak terbiasa membaca teks instruksi.	Disediakan area yang lebih luas untuk meletakkan barang bawaan saat menggunakan <i>Autogate</i> . Papan instruksi lebih jelas dengan berbagai bahasa dan diagram langkah-langkah akan sangat membantu.

Picture 13. Researcher interview

Based on the interview results above, it can be concluded that the the implementation of the *Autogate* system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has had a significant impact on improving the quality of public services in the field of immigration, especially from the perspective of counter officers.

Based on interview excerpts with *Autogate* user passengers, Mrs. Smith Patricia Ann (US Citizen) and Mrs. Shah Devanshi Bankim (Indian Citizen), it can be concluded that the evaluation of the *Autogate* system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport shows results that are relevant to the Public Service Standards as regulated in Law Number 25 of 2009.

Based on the overall interviews conducted by researchers with several sources, it can be concluded that the Implementation of the *Autogate* system at the Immigration Checkpoint of I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali International Airport has shown significant progress in improving the quality of public services in the field of immigration.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

The *Autogate* system at TPI Ngurah Rai has been effectively integrated with the immigration system, providing fast and accurate facial biometric verification, supported by well-trained officers. However, several challenges remain, including technical issues such as internet network instability, hardware failures, and software updates, as well as human resource limitations due to insufficient technical skills. Additionally, certain passenger groups, such as the elderly and those with non-electronic passports, face difficulties in using the system, while infrastructure constraints, such as space limitations and the need for better integration with the Passenger Profiling Information System, present further challenges. To address these issues, routine maintenance of both

hardware and software is crucial, alongside continuous training for officers and public outreach efforts to educate passengers on the use of Autogate. Periodic evaluations are also necessary to identify problems and implement effective solutions.

The implementation of Autogate has significantly enhanced public service efficiency by expediting immigration inspections and reducing queues. Its biometric verification process ensures transparency and accountability, while user satisfaction surveys help maintain service quality. Despite these advancements, accessibility concerns persist, highlighting the need for a more inclusive system. Regular training for officers reflects professionalism, and continuous system development efforts support the sustainability of this technology-driven service. While the Autogate system has contributed positively to immigration services, further improvements in accessibility and inclusiveness are essential to ensure that all passengers can benefit equally. With continuous enhancements, the system has the potential to serve as a model for technology-based public services in the immigration sector.

To optimize the Autogate system, several improvements should be prioritized. Infrastructure enhancements, such as increasing server capacity to accommodate peak travel periods and integrating the system with the Passenger Profiling Information System, will enhance efficiency. Developing adaptive verification features for individuals with special needs, including persons with disabilities, is also essential. Routine maintenance must be carried out regularly to prevent technical issues, while user interface improvements, such as interactive visual prompts and multilingual voice guidance, can enhance the overall user experience. Facility design should also be adjusted to accommodate passengers with additional needs by expanding luggage areas and providing dedicated lanes for seniors and children.

Public awareness campaigns should be strengthened through various media, including the e-Visa portal, social media platforms, and video tutorials, ensuring passengers are well-informed on how to use the system. Clear, step-by-step instructions in multiple languages will further assist foreign travelers. Additionally, improving officer service quality through regular technical and empathy-based training will enhance user support, while rewarding innovative and high-performing officers can encourage service excellence. Strengthening supervision and evaluation mechanisms is also necessary, with regular performance reviews and user satisfaction surveys helping to maintain high standards. Regulatory revisions should accommodate passengers who cannot use Autogate, such as those with non-electronic passports, and the formation of an evaluation team will ensure user feedback is analyzed effectively to drive policy improvements. Lastly, collaboration with key stakeholders, including airlines, airport operators, and immigration authorities, will facilitate data integration and streamline inspection processes, ultimately enhancing the overall efficiency and effectiveness of the Autogate system.

ADVANCED RESEARCH

Future research on the Autogate system should focus on enhancing its accessibility and inclusivity, particularly for passengers with special needs, elderly travelers, and those using non-electronic passports. Investigating adaptive biometric verification technologies, such as iris or fingerprint scanning as alternatives to facial recognition, could improve system usability for a broader range of users. Additionally, research on optimizing infrastructure, including server capacity expansion and seamless integration with the Passenger Profiling Information System, would help minimize technical disruptions. Another crucial area is the effectiveness of public outreach strategies in increasing passenger awareness and compliance with Autogate procedures. Comparative studies between Autogate systems in different international airports could also provide valuable insights into best practices and potential improvements. Lastly, evaluating the long-term impact of Autogate on immigration efficiency, security, and user satisfaction through empirical studies will help shape future policies for more effective and technologically advanced public service models.

REFERENCES

- adminNGR. (2024, Oktober 2). 90 Autogate Dioperasikan, Pemeriksaan Keimigrasian Di Bandara Ngurah Rai Jadi Semakin Cepat Dan Praktis. Retrieved from Humas Kantor Imigrasi Ngurah Rai: <https://imigrasingurahrai.kemenkumham.go.id/>
- adminNGR. (2024). Indeks Kepuasan Masyarakat. Retrieved from Instagram Kantor Imigrasi Ngurah Rai: <https://www.instagram.com/imngurahrai/>
- adminNGR. (2024, Oktober 1). Silmy Karim: Autogate Bandara I Gusti Ngurah Rai - Bali diresmikan, Melintas Lebih Cepat, Lebih Nyaman. Retrieved from Humas Kantor Imigrasi Ngurah Rai: <https://imigrasingurahrai.kemenkumham.go.id/>
- Alifine Qinthara Fatharani, d. (2021). Penggunaan Autogate di Tempat Pemeriksaan Imigrasi Bandar Udara Internasional Soekarno-Hatta
- BPK, J. (2019). Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 28 Tahun 2019 Jenis dan Tarif atas Jenis Penerimaan Negara Bukan Pajak yang Berlaku pada Kementerian Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia. Jakarta.
- Cahyani, R. I. (2021). Penggunaan Sistem Autogate dalam membantu Keefektifan Pemeriksaan Keimigrasian di Bandara Soekarno Hatta.
- Dewa Ketut Sudiarta Wiguna. (2024, Juli 20). Imigrasi Ngurah Rai Bali setor PNBP Rp963,4 miliar. Retrieved from Kantor Berita Antara: <https://www.antaranews.com/>
- Eko Handoyo. (2012, Oktober). Kebijakan Publik. (Mustrose, Ed.) 108.

- Huwei, J. R. (2024). Analisis Layout Penempatan Autogate Imigrasi guna Mempercepat Proses Boarding di Terminal 2 Bandar Udara Internasional Juanda Surabaya
- Indonesia, O. R. (2017). Standar Pelayanan Publik Sesuai UU No 25 Tahun 2009 Survei Ombudsman RI. Jakarta.
- KemenpanRB. (2009). Undang-undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2009 tentang Pelayanan Publik. Jakarta.
- Kemenkumham. (2011). Undang-undang Nomor 6 Tahun 2011 tentang Keimigrasian. Jakarta.
- Kemenkumham. (2013). Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 31 Tahun 2013 tentang Peraturan Pelaksanaan Undang-undang Nomor 6 Tahun 2011 tentang Keimigrasian. Jakarta.
- Kemenkumham. (2021). Peraturan Menteri Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia Nomor 29 Tahun 2021 tentang Visa dan Izin Tinggal. Jakarta.
- Kemenkumham. (2024). Keputusan Direktur Jenderal Imigrasi Nomor IMI-825.GR.01.01 Tentang Autogate. Jakarta
- Kemenkumham. (2024). Peraturan Menteri Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia Nomor 9 Tahun 2024 tentang Tata Cara Pemeriksaan Keimigrasian terhadap Orang Yang Masuk atau Keluar Wilayah Indonesia. Jakarta
- Nilam Rizky Anugerah, A. R. (2019). Kontradiktif Implementasi Autogate terhadap Cap Keimigrasian (Contradictive Autogate Implementation Of Immigration Stamp).
- Permenpan. (2014). Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Sipil Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi. Jakarta.
- Pramono, Joko. (2020). Implementasi dan Evaluasi Kebijakan Publik. Teori Mengenai Implementasi Kebijakan, 4-11.
- Puteri Shabrina Adani, d. (2022). Implementasi Kebijakan Visa On Arrival (VOA) dalam Meningkatkan Kunjungan Wisatawan Mancanegara di Provinsi Bali
- Santoso, S. B. (2022). Implementasi Sistem Autogate terhadap jumlah perlintasan warga negara Indonesia pada TPI Soekarno Hatta
- Solichin Abdul Wahab. (2004). Implementasi Kebijakan Publik. 64
- Sugiyono. (2016). Teknik analisis data. 60.
- Wibowo, R. A. (2023). Efektivitas penerapan Electronic Visa On Arrival (E-VOA) di Tempat Pemeriksaan Imigrasi Bandara Internasional I Gusti Ngurah Rai Bali.