

Analysis of Zonation System Policy in New Student Admission in State Senior High School 11 Denpasar

Anak Agung Bagus Darma Udayana
Master of Public Administration Student, Mahendradatta University

Corresponding Author: Anak Agung Bagus Darma Udayana

Bagusdewi777@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Education, Zoning System, Policy

Received : 29, December

Revised : 19, January

Accepted: 24, February

©2025 Udayana: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

Education plays a crucial role in preparing children for the future. However, disparities in access to education remain a challenge in Indonesia, particularly in underdeveloped regions. The zoning system, regulated by Permendikbud No. 14 of 2018, was introduced to ensure fair student distribution and eliminate distinctions between "favorite" and "non-favorite" schools. This study examines the implementation of the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar, identifying supporting and hindering factors, and evaluating the policy. Using a qualitative approach, data were collected through interviews, observations, and document analysis. Findings indicate that implementation has been relatively effective, supported by government policies, adequate facilities, and qualified teachers. However, challenges include community perceptions of superior schools, last-minute student verification, website errors, and difficulties in the online admission process. Policy evaluation is based on effectiveness, accuracy, adequacy, equity, and responsiveness. Recommendations are provided to enhance the zoning system's effectiveness in achieving equitable education access.

INTRODUCTION

Education is a very important activity for preparing children to face their future lives. Education is the process of developing individual skills in attitudes and behavior in society. A social process in which a person is influenced by an organized environment, such as a home or school, so that they can achieve self-development and social skills.

Equal access to education is one of the problems faced by the world of Indonesian education. There are still gaps in several regions in Indonesia in obtaining proper access to education. Several underdeveloped regions in Indonesia have not received good educational facilities. One of the efforts to overcome this problem is the Indonesian Government issuing a zoning policy which is regulated in Permendikbud No. 44 of 2019 concerning the Admission of New Students in Kindergartens, Elementary Schools, Middle Schools, High Schools, and Vocational Schools. The implementation of the zoning policy has been implemented in several local governments in Indonesia, one of which is the Bali Provincial Government which has implemented a zoning policy in several districts and cities.

The zoning system is a system for regulating the process of accepting new students according to their area of residence. This system is regulated in Permendikbud Number 14 of 2018 and is intended so that there are no schools that are considered favorite and non-favorite schools. SMA Negeri 11 was established in 2021, where in that year the zoning system was established. As a new school, SMAN 11 Denpasar faces unique challenges, such as building a reputation, improving the quality of learning, and attracting students in its zone area. On the other hand, the zoning system also brings opportunities for this school to accept students with more diverse backgrounds, so that it can create an inclusive learning environment. This research is important to do because it can provide an overview of the impact of the zoning system on new schools, especially in urban areas such as Denpasar. The results of this study are expected to be a reference for the government, schools, and education stakeholders in optimizing the zoning system policy, especially for newly established schools.

In conclusion, this study provides valuable insights into the implementation of the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar, highlighting both its successes and challenges. The findings reveal that while the policy has contributed to a more equitable distribution of students, certain obstacles, such as public perception and technical issues, still hinder its effectiveness. By analyzing the factors that support and impede the system, this research offers a comprehensive evaluation that can serve as a reference for policymakers, schools, and the community. Theoretically, it enriches the understanding of zoning policies in Indonesia's education system, while practically, it provides guidance for improvements at both the governmental and institutional levels. Through continuous evaluation and necessary adjustments, the zoning system can be refined to ensure a more inclusive and accessible education for all students. This research ultimately emphasizes the importance of collaboration

between stakeholders to optimize policy implementation and enhance the overall quality of education in Indonesia.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Education System

Indonesia's founding fathers recognized the strategic role of education, as seen in Article 31 of the 1945 Constitution (UUD). This was due to Indonesia's long colonial period, in contrast to Europe's modernization during the Renaissance (Soedijarto, 2007).

Law No. 20 of 2003 on the National Education System (UU SISDIKNAS) defines education as an interconnected system aimed at achieving national goals (Soetarno, 2003). Key components include the environment, facilities, resources, and the community, all working together. The system is centralized, with regulations covering curriculum, teaching methods, and assessments nationwide. National education aims to develop students who are religious, ethical, knowledgeable, creative, independent, and responsible citizens.

Public Policy

Public policy refers to government decisions on actions or inactions (Dye, 2002). Anderson (in Hill & Hupe, 2002) defines it as a series of actions addressing problems, while Friedrich views it as goal-oriented decisions.

Policies operate at three levels (Abidin, 2006):

- a) General Policy - Broad guidelines (e.g., laws, government regulations).
- b) Implementation Policy - Detailed directives from ministries or regional governments.
- c) Technical Policy - Operational instructions (e.g., circulars).

New Student Admissions Zoning System (PPDB)

The PPDB zoning policy, introduced in 2017 under President Joko Widodo, aims to eliminate favoritism among schools and ensure students attend schools near their homes (Mahpudin, 2020).

Key regulations:

- a) Schools must accept at least 90% of students from the nearest zone (Permendikbud No. 17/2017).
- b) 5% of seats are for students applying based on achievements outside the zone (Permendikbud No. 14/2018).
- c) The goal is equitable education quality and access (Haryanti, 2020).

Factors Influencing Zoning Policy Implementation

According to Edward III (1980), four factors impact policy success:

- a) Communication - Clear and consistent messaging.
- b) Resources - Adequate staffing, information, and facilities.
- c) Disposition - Commitment and honesty from implementers.
- d) Bureaucratic Structure - Effective coordination and clear procedures.
- e) Imron (2008) adds other challenges: policy complexity, unclear formulation, limited resources, implementer expertise, public support, and bureaucratic efficiency.

Public Policy Evaluation

Policy evaluation assesses effectiveness based on goal achievement (Dunn, 2003). It provides feedback on implementation and ensures policies address issues efficiently (Trochim, 2009). Evaluations are crucial for refining policy mechanisms and decision-making.

Table 1. Policy Evaluation Criteria

Tipe Kriteria	Pertanyaan	Ilustrasi
Efektivitas	Apakah hasil yang diinginkan telah tercapai?	Unit pelayanan
Efisiensi	Seberapa banyak usaha yang diperlukan untuk mencapai hasil yang diinginkan	Unit biaya, manfaat bersih, rasio cost-benefit
Kecukupan	Seberapa jauh pencapaian hasil yang diinginkan memecahkan masalah	Biaya tetap, efektivitas tetap
Perataan	Apakah biaya manfaat didistribusikan dengan merata kepada kelompok-kelompok yang berbeda	Kriteria Pareto, Kriteria Kaldor-Hicks, kriteria Rawls
Responsivitas	Apakah hasil kebijakan memuaskan kebutuhan, preferensi, atau nilai kelompok-kelompok tertentu	Konsisten dengan survey warga negara
Ketepatan	Apakah hasil atau tujuan yang diinginkan benar-benar berguna atau bernilai	Program publik harus merata dan efisien

METHODOLOGY

This study adopts a qualitative research approach, as described by Kirk & Miller, which emphasizes observing people in their natural environment and using their own language. The qualitative method is chosen to explore the implementation of the zoning system policy in high schools by collecting data from both field observations and relevant literature. This approach enables a holistic and contextual understanding of the policy's impact at SMAN 11 Denpasar.

The study utilizes both primary and secondary data. Primary data is gathered through direct observations and open-ended interviews with the principal, teachers, administrative staff, and students to understand their experiences with the zoning system. Meanwhile, secondary data is obtained from various written sources such as books, articles, reports, and official documents to support and validate the findings.

The data collection techniques include observation, interviews, and documentation study. Observations allow researchers to witness firsthand how the zoning system is applied in the school. Interviews provide in-depth insights from key stakeholders, helping to clarify and expand on the findings.

Additionally, a documentation study is conducted to collect supporting information from written records and reports related to the zoning policy.

The collected data is analyzed using the Miles & Huberman (1992) model, which consists of three steps: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. Data reduction involves selecting and organizing key information while eliminating irrelevant details. The processed data is then presented in an organized manner, such as through tables or summaries, to identify patterns and relationships. Finally, conclusions are drawn by interpreting the findings and verifying them through comparisons with existing literature and further reflections.

By following this methodology, the study aims to provide a clear and comprehensive analysis of the zoning system's implementation in high schools, particularly at SMAN 11 Denpasar.

RESEARCH RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Implementation of Zoning System Policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar

The zoning system is a reform arrangement in the division of school areas. as a whole. The current zoning system is the main foundation for school reform arrangements from Kindergarten (TK) to High School (SMA). The Zoning System that regulates the area zones for prospective students is included in the new PPDB System through Permendikbud No.14 of 2018. The recent zoning system is basically almost the same as the Community Development System, except that the quota for this zoning system is much greater than the community development, reaching 90%.

In accordance with the government's commitment to equality, joint efforts are needed to increase access and offer more and better opportunities to the community, in this case the participation in basic education is still very low. Indonesia needs to improve the quality of education by expanding access to early childhood education and improving quality through nationally approved standards, stronger provider licensing, and the development of specialist supervisory cadres for each level of education. In an interview with the principal of SMAN 11 Denpasar I Ketut Suwita, he said "since its establishment in 2021, SMAN 11 Denpasar has implemented a zoning system policy, although there are still some obstacles in its implementation, but so far the quality of education provided by SMAN 11 Denpasar has been very good. Of course, we receive a lot of input and suggestions from both students and parents of students and we always use all of them as evaluation material in the future".

In line with what the principal said, the vice principal of curriculum I Wayan Gede Wardika also said something similar, "the quality of education provided by SMAN 11 Denpasar is already very good, and with this zoning system, it is easier for schools that can be said to be newly established to get students easily. Our current challenge is how SMAN 11 Denpasar can improve the quality of its education and provide adequate facilities and infrastructure so that parents of students do not worry about their children's future."

The implementation of the PPDB zoning system is stated in the Governor Regulation Number 20 of 2019 concerning New Student Admissions (PPDB) where this regulation specifically regulates PPDB in Bali Province including

zoning mechanisms, quotas, and requirements. The implementation of the PPDB zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar consists of 3 stages, namely: preparation stage, implementation stage, and evaluation stage.

Supporting and Inhibiting Factors of the Zoning System Policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar

The implementation of the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar has supporting and inhibiting factors that influence the success of this policy. Here is a complete analysis of these factors.

1. Supporting factors for the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar

- a) *Government Support.* The central government has established a clear policy on the zoning system regulated through the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation Number 1 of 2021 and the Bali Governor Regulation Number 20 of 2019, thus providing a strong legal basis.
- b) *Good facilities and infrastructure.* Good facilities at SMA Negeri 11 Denpasar can have a significant positive impact on students, teachers, and the school environment as a whole. Based on the results of an interview with Mrs. Ni Nyoman Ayu Arina as the vice principal for facilities and infrastructure, she said "The facilities provided by SMAN 11 are currently complete and meet national standards so that students do not need to worry about the quality of learning at SMAN 11 Denpasar. This school has a library, two laboratories, a UKS room, 14 toilets, a counseling room, and an OSIS room. So there is no need to question the facilities that we can provide".
- c) *Teacher quality.* Teachers at SMAN 11 Denpasar have good competence and have undergone training to face the challenges of the zoning system, such as teaching students with diverse abilities. SMAN 11 Denpasar itself has an A (superior) accreditation which shows that the quality of its teachers and schools is good.
- d) *Good cooperation between all implementing elements.* In the implementation of the PPDB zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar, the implementation from the appointment of the committee to the announcement of the selection results can run smoothly, although there are several problems, but these can be responded to quickly and responsively by the implementing committee.

2. Inhibiting factors of the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar

- a) *PPDB website server capacity.* The PPDB website server capacity is inadequate, resulting in frequent errors when accessed by new student applicants simultaneously.
- b) *New students carry out verification at the last minute.* There are many new students who are still verifying at the last minute, causing a buildup of participants during the verification process. This can

be overcome by scheduling verification of prospective students so that there will be no buildup of new students at school.

- c) Prospective new students and their parents do not yet understand the process and how to register for the PPDB zoning system. For prospective participants who are having problems with the online PPDB process, they can go directly to the school to get guidance or they can also watch a tutorial on filling out the online PPDB form on YouTube or Google.
- d) *The community's mindset towards superior schools.* Even though the zoning system has been running for quite a long time, there are still people who compare new schools such as SMAN 11 Denpasar with schools that used to be excellent schools.

Evaluation of Zoning System Policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar

According to Dunn (2000) explains that the first and most important function of public policy evaluation is that evaluation provides valid and reliable information about policy performance. Second, evaluation contributes to clarification and criticism of the values underlying the selection of goals and targets. Third, evaluation contributes to the application of other policy analysis methods, including problem formulation and recommendations. The policy evaluation criteria used in this study are effectiveness, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy with the following details.

a) Effectiveness

Effectiveness is a benchmark in implementing a policy, to what extent the program or policy is running according to the expected goals. Based on the results of the researcher's observations, the implementation of the zoning system policy in PPDB has been running well and in accordance with the initial policy implementation based on Permendikbud No. 51 of 2018. Although there are still some pros and cons, especially from parents regarding this zoning system due to the very close distance difference and the website which still often errors when accessed by many people. So far it cannot be said that this zoning system policy is running effectively, especially in achieving its main goal, namely equalizing the quality of education. There is still a fairly large difference in facilities between high schools that were previously superior schools and other schools so that parents still often force their children to enter the previously superior schools.

b) Adequacy

The definition of adequacy in public policy is intended as the goal achieved is considered sufficient in various aspects (Panggulu 2013). In its implementation, this zoning system is still not felt positively by most prospective students. Only a few people feel the positive impact, especially those whose homes are close to public schools even though their exam scores are relatively low. From several interviews with parents of students, they stated that this zoning system makes them more troublesome in taking care of their children's school, starting from having to register online and determining the distance from their home to their school.

c) *Equality*

Equality when viewed from the aspect of public school facilities and infrastructure available in Denpasar City itself is still considered insufficient because its distribution is still uneven. Based on the results of observations, for schools that were previously labeled favorite schools, the facilities and infrastructure obtained were sufficient to support teaching and learning activities, compared to schools that are not classified as favorite schools with limited classrooms and inadequate facilities.

d) *Responsiveness*

According to William N. Dunn, responsiveness is concerned with how far a policy can meet the needs, preferences, or values of a particular community group (Lejiu & Irawan, 2017). The success or failure of a policy can be seen from the response given by the community. A positive response can be well received by the community in the form of support, conversely if the response given by the community is negative, it will usually be in the form of rejection of the policy being implemented. In this study, after the implementation of the zoning system in PPDB, this policy has received many negative responses, especially from the guardians of prospective students. From the data obtained, there were guardians who were disappointed because their children who had been registered at a public school had to move to SMAN 11 Denpasar due to the small distance difference with other prospective students. Disappointment was also felt by other students whose grades met the standard but did not pass at the nearest public school only because they lost to the distance of their homes which were closer to the public school.

e) *Accuracy*

Accuracy refers to the value of the program or policy objectives that underlie the objectives. The results that show the value of the benefits of the policy will be compared with the initial intent and purpose of the policy so that it can show whether the policy is right or not on target (Lejiu & Irawan, 2017). Overall, the zoning system for PPDB at the State High School level is still considered not on target. Because there is still a lack of government readiness in providing facilities and the uneven distribution of state schools in each sub-district and the complicated registration system so that it has reaped a lot of rejection from the community. However, even though it is not fully on target, the distribution of education in Denpasar City has shown significant progress.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

Conclusion

The implementation of the zoning system policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar has been very good. The existence of this zoning system makes it easier for new schools to get students more easily. SMAN 11 Denpasar has been accredited A so that the quality of its teaching staff is not in doubt. The PPDB zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar consists of 3 stages, namely: the preparation stage, the implementation stage, and the evaluation stage. Each stage in accepting new

students has gone quite well which has led to SMAN 11 Denpasar's reputation being very good in the eyes of the public.

Factors that influence the zoning system policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar consist of supporting and inhibiting factors. Supporting factors for zoning at SMAN 11 Denpasar are: government support, good facilities and infrastructure, teacher quality, and good cooperation between implementing elements. Meanwhile, inhibiting factors for the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar are: insufficient capacity of the PPDB website server, students verifying at the last minute, prospective students and their guardians do not understand the online PPDB zoning system, and the community's mindset towards superior schools.

Evaluation of the zoning system policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar is based on 5 criteria, namely: effectiveness, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy. This zoning system policy still cannot be said to be effective because its main objective for equalizing education has not been met.

Recommendation

The implementation of the zoning system at SMAN 11 Denpasar itself is very good, but still needs to be improved, especially in the socialization regarding the online PPDB registration procedures and the clarity of the zoning system for guardians of prospective students.

Based on the factors that hinder the zoning system policy, the most crucial thing to overcome is the public mindset towards superior schools. This must be responded to by increasing the quality standards of public schools in Denpasar so that everything is equal so that socialization related to the zoning system and the absence of superior schools can run better.

The evaluation of the zoning system policy at SMAN 11 Denpasar has been very good, in the future SMAN 11 Denpasar needs to be even better in improving the facilities and infrastructure available at the school and always maintaining the quality and standard of its teaching staff so as not to lose when competing with other state schools.

ADVANCED RESEARCH

Future research on the zoning system policy can explore its long-term impact on educational equity and student performance across different schools. Comparative studies between schools with varying accreditation levels could provide deeper insights into whether the policy truly fosters equal access to quality education. Additionally, research focusing on public perception and behavioral changes towards the zoning system may help address the mindset that favors certain "superior" schools. Further investigation into the effectiveness of online registration systems and strategies to improve community awareness could also contribute to refining the policy's implementation.

REFERENCES

- Abdussamad, Z. 2022. Buku Metode Penelitian Kualitatif. OSF.
- Agustino, L. 2008. Dasar-dasar Kebijakan Publik. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Aprillia Putri et al. 2020. Evaluation of the Zoning System Policy in the Admission of New Students at the Junior High School Level in Surabaya City. *Journal* (accessed January 14, 2025). Available in URL: <https://jurnal.syntaxtransformation.co.id/index.php/jst/article/view/23>
- Dunn, Willian N.2000. Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Edisi Kedua. Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University Press.
- Hidayat, Rais. 2013. Evaluation of the Indonesian National Education System. *Journal* (accessed November 26, 2024). Available in URL: <https://repository.unpak.ac.id/tukangna/repo/file/files-20180112102010.pdf>
- Iskandar, D. 2022. Metodologi penelitian kualitatif: Petunjuk praktis untuk penelitian lapangan, analisis teks media, dan kajian budaya. Maghza Pustaka.
- Kaffa, Zelmi et al. 2021. Zoning System Implementation Policy. *Journal* (accessed November 15, 2024). Available at URL: <https://jptam.org/index.php/jptam/article/view/1193>
- Miles and Huberman. 2007. Analisis Data Kualitatif. Jakarta: UI Press.
- Moleong, Lexy J. 2005. Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosda Karya.
- Munirah. 2015. Education System in Indonesia: Between Desires and Reality. *Journal* (accessed 26 November 2024). Available in URL: https://core.ac.uk/outputs/234746404/?utm_source=pdf&utm_medium=banner&utm_campaign=pdf-decoration-v1
- Nasution, A. F. (2023). Metode penelitian kualitatif. Harfa Creative.
- Nudin, Burhan. Manajemen Peserta Didik, Yogyakarta: Universitas Islam Indonesia, 2022.
- Nugroho, R. (2008). Public Policy. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo.
- Nurjaningsih, ST. 2019. Management of New Student Admissions (PPDB) Zoning System. *Journal* (accessed January 11, 2025). Available in URL: <https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/jtkp/article/view/32544>
- Pasolong, H. (2013). Teori Administrasi Publik. Bandung: Alfabeta.

- Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, Kementerian. Ikhtisar Data Pendidikan tahun 2016/2017, Jakarta: Pusat Data dan Statistik Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Peraturan menteri pendidikan dan kebudayaan Nomor 14 Tahun 2018 Tentang Sistem Zonasi Penerimaan Peserta Didik Baru (PPDB).
- Purba, Sukarman. 2021. Teori Manajemen Pendidikan, Medan: Yayasan Kita Menulis.
- Ridwanca, Ardian. 2024. Implementation of Zoning System Policy in New Student Admissions at the East Java Provincial Education Office. Journal (accessed January 11, 2025). Available at URL: <https://manggalajournal.org/index.php/cendekia/article/view/583/748>
- Rusli, B. 2015. Kebijakan Publik Membangun Pelayanan Publik yang Responsif. Bandung: CV. ADOYA Mitra Sejahtera.
- Saharuddin, Erni. 2020. Implementation of Zoning System Policy in New Student Admissions at High School Level in the Special Region of Yogyakarta. Journal (accessed December 02, 2024). Available in URL: <https://jurnal.unigal.ac.id/dinamika/article/download/4226/pdf>
- Setiawati, Novinda Dwi. 2022. Implementation of the PPDB Zoning System Policy at State Middle School 3 Krian, Sidoarjo Regency. Journal (accessed November 25, 2024). Available in URL: <https://ejournal.unesa.ac.id/index.php/publika/article/view/45406/38462>
- Sidik, Fajar. 2024. Implementation of School Zoning Policy and Its Impact on School Quality at the Junior High School Level: Case Study in Sleman Regency, Yogyakarta. Journal (accessed December 01, 2024). Available in URL: <https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/humanika/article/download/68551/pdf>
- Solichin, Abdul Wahab. 1997. Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Cet. Pertama. Malang: IKIP Malang
- Syaiful Anam, Hasbullah. 2019. Evaluation of the Zoning System Policy in New Student Admissions (PPDB) at the State Junior High School (SMPN) Level in Pamekasan Regency. Journal (accessed November 15, 2024). Available in URL: <https://jurnal.unitri.ac.id/index.php/reformasi/article/view/1413>
- Waluyo. 2007. Manajemen Publik (konsep, aplikasi dan implementasinya dalam pelaksanaan otonomi daerah). Bandung: Mandar Maju

Yuliah, Elih. 2020. Implementation of Education Policy. Journal (accessed January 20, 2025). Available in URL: <https://ejournal.inkhas.ac.id/index.php/attadbir/article/view/58>